BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10084234 3

FAMILY LAW

SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

Carol Rogerson

1986-87

Toronto

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

1986

Prepared with the assistance of
Kathleen Baker

LAW LIBRARY

SEP 3 1986

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FAMILY LAW

SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

Carol Rogerson

1986-87

Toronto

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

1986

Prepared with the assistance of
Kathleen Baker

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/familylawsupplem00roge_1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PAGE

I. INTRODUCTION: THE FAMILY AND FAMILY LAW

1. The Family as Basic Social Unit 1

2. What is the Family? Definitions and Demographics

Eichler, Families in Canada Today 3
Globe and Mail, "New Definition for Family Unit in Zonings" 31

3. The Family and Family Law: The Justification for Legal Intervention

Glendon, "The New Marriage and the New Property" 32
Eekelaar, Family Law and Social Policy 40
Minow, "Beyond State Intervention in the Family" 47

4. The Institutional Framework: The Family Court

Szwed, "The Family Court" 53

II. MARRIAGE AND NULLITY

1. The Legal Significance of Marriage

O'Donovan, "Legal Marriage--Who Needs It?" 61
Clive, "Marriage: An Unnecessary Legal Concept?"

2. Validity of Marriage

(i) Requirement of Opposite Sexes

Adams and Sullivan v. Howerton 72
M. v. M. (A) 76
Anderson v. Luoma 79

(ii) Prohibited Degrees of Affinity and Consanguinity

Bratt, "Incest Statutes and the Fundamental Right of Marriage" 83
Globe and Mail, "Senate Works on Marriage Law Reform" 93
Parry, "Comment" 94

(iii) Polygamy and Bigamy

Law Reform Commission of Canada, Working Paper #42, Bigamy 95

(iv) Limited Purpose Marriages (Immigration Marriages)

Asser v. Peermohamed 99
Singla v. Singla 101
Globe and Mail, "Marriages of Convenience out for Immigrants" 103

(v) Age

Wardle, "Rethinking Marital Age Restrictions" 104

III. DIVORCE

1. The Social Context of Divorce

Hahlo, "The Changing Face of Marriage and Divorce" 106
Globe and Mail, "Canadian Statistics Disclose 40% Probability of Divorce" 111

2. Substantive Reform of Divorce Law: Grounds for Divorce

Amiel, "The Fault in No-Fault Divorce" 112

3. Procedural Reform of Divorce Law

Divorce Law In Canada: Proposals for Change, 1984 113
Globe and Mail, articles re: undefended divorce procedure 115

4. The 1985 Divorce Act

"Information Paper" 117

IV. THE FAMILY AS AN ECONOMIC UNIT

Boulet and Lavallee, The Changing Economic Status of Women 123
Globe and Mail, "Women Sacrifice Career Plans for Family Statscan Says" 126
Statistics Canada, Women in Canada: A Statistical Report 127
Eekelaar, "The Economics of Family Breakdown" 133
Eekelaar, "Adjustment on Divorce" 140

V. PROPERTY

1. Trust Doctrine

Murray v. Roty 147
Herman v. Smith 153
Sorochan v. Sorochan 158

2. Matrimonial Property Legislation

(i) Conceptions of Appropriate Matrimonial Property Legislation

Knetsch, "Some Economic Implications of Matrimonial Property Rules" 162
Prager, "Shifting Perspectives on Marital Property Law" 171
Holland, "Is Ontario Matrimonial Property Legislation in Need of Reform?" 176
McBean, "B.C., Alberta and Saskatchewan: Reasonable Laws Reasonably Applied" 181

3. Ontario's New Property Legislation: The Family Law Act, 1985

(i) What is Property? Educational Degrees and Pensions

(a) Educational Degrees

O'Brien v. O'Brien 187
Whitehead (Burrell) v. Burrell 193

(b) Pensions

Day and Horwood, "Canada Pension Plan" 195
Globe and Mail, "Ex-Wives Can't Claim Share of Pension" 196

(ii) Departures From 50-50 Sharing

Marks v. Marks 197
Janis v. Thorpe 208

(iii) Application on Death

Goodman, "Depletion of Net Family Property" 210

VI. POSSESSORY RIGHTS IN THE MATRIMONIAL HOME

1. Recent Reform

Ministry of the A.-G., "Background Notes on the F.L.A., 1985". 220

2. Orders for Exclusive Possession

C.B.A. Recommendations 221
West v. West 223
Re Metcalf and Metcalf 224

VII. SPOUSAL SUPPORT

1. The Appropriate Principles of Spousal Support

Deech, "The Principles of Maintenance" 227
Deech, "Financial Relief" 232
Weitzman, "The Economics of Divorce" (Table) 233
Smart, "Marriage, Divorce and Women's Economic Dependency" 234
Land, "Changing Women's Claims to Maintenance" 236
Eekelaar, "Maintenance and Children" 241
Abella, "Economic Adjustment on Marriage Breakdown" 246

2. Reform of Support Law in Canada

a) Ontario

Ministry of the A.-G., "Background Notes on the F.L.A." 251

b) Canada

Ministry of Justice and A.-G. (Can.), "Information Paper" 252

3. Judicial Treatment of Spousal Support

a) Conduct

Horlock v. Horlock 256
Hogue v. Hogue 258
Beggs v. Beggs 260

b) Capacity for Self-Support

Karlovcec v. Karlovcec 261
Ellis v. Ellis 265
Richards v. Richards 267

(c) Relationship Between Child Support and Spousal Support

Jull v. Jull 270
Binns v. Binns 273

(d) Past Contributions

Porter v. Porter 275

(e) Dependency Caused by the Relationship

Cure v. Cure 280
Sullivan v. Fox 281
Bebakhee v. Bebakhee 285

(f) Support and Welfare

Cassie v. Cassie 290
Passerino v. Passerino 292

VIII. CHILD SUPPORT

1. Establishing a Parent-Child Relationship

(a) Paternity

Leydit v. Alford 294
Fallon v. Rivers 298

(b) Extended Definition of Parent-Child Relationship

Hines v. Davy 303
Pickup v. Pickup 307

(c) Age Limits

Nowe v. Nowe 314

2. Principles of Child Support

Kurt v. Kurt 325
Friesen v. Friesen 330
Twaddle v. Twaddle 334

IX. VARIATION AND ENFORCEMENT OF SUPPORT ORDERS

1. Variation

(a) Jurisdiction

Cotter v. Cotter 337

(b) Cost-of-Living

Jarvis v. Jarvis 343
Globe and Mail, "Court Approves Cost-of-Living Payment to Wife" 344
A.-G. (Ont.), "Background Notes on the F.L.A." 345

(c) Balancing Support Obligations Between First and Second Families

Sinclair v. Sinclair 346
Cooper v. Cooper 350
Torrance v. Torrance 353
Pederson v. Pederson 355
Sawchyn v. Sawchyn 358
A.-G. (Ont.), "Background Notes on the F.L.A." 359

2. Interplay of Federal and Provincial Laws

Sniderman v. Sniderman 360
Dufrat v. Dufrat 364
Gomes v. Gomes 367
Lamb v. Lamb 368
Pantry v. Pantry 371

X DOMESTIC CONTRACTS

Balfour v. Balfour 373
Mnookin, "Divorce Bargaining" 374
Richardson v. Richardson 378
Caron v. Caron 379

XI CHILD CUSTODY AND ACCESS

1. Parental Disputes Over Custody

(i) Overview of the Issues

Folberg "Custody Overview" 381

(ii) Custody in a Historical Perspective

Maidment, "Judicial Creation of the Welfare Principle" 387
Smart and Brophy, "Mothers and Children" 397

(iii) The Social Science Perspective on Custody

Maidment, "Children of Divorce: Theoretical and Empirical Considerations" 398
Goldstein et al., Beyond the Best Interests of the Child (excerpts) 410

(iv) Judicial Resolution of Custody Disputes: The Principles

(a) Status Quo

Novic v. Novic 417

(b) Tender Years

Talsky v. Talsky 422
R. v. R. 427
Bendale v. Bendale 439

(c) Conduct

Cooney v. Cooney 444
Fishback v. Fishback 448

(d) Sexual Preference of Parent

Bezaire v. Bezaire 454
Globe and Mail, "U.S. S. Ct. Forbids Racial Bias in Child Custody Cases" 458

(e) Religion

Brown v. Brown 459

(f) The "Friendly Parent"

Tyndale v. Tyndale 465
Purvey v. Purvey 467

(g) Wishes of Child

Burgmaier v. Burgmaier 470
M. v. M. 472

(v) Access

Thorne v. Thorne 475
Chase v. Chase 476
Globe and Mail, "Mother Forbidden to Move Children Too Far From Father" 479

(vi) Improving Custody Determinations

(a) Substantive Reforms: Joint Custody

Folberg "Joint Custody" 480
Globe and Mail, "Parents March Over Custody" 484
Parsons v. Parsons 485
Globe and Mail, "Joint Custody Viable Option, Study Finds" 488

(b) Institutional Reforms: Mediation

Bottomley, "A Feminist Critique of Conciliation 489

(vii) Variantion and Enforcement of Custody Orders

Cant v. Cant 493

2. The Wider Family: Non-Parental Custody and Access Disputes

(a) Custody

Racine v. Woods 497

(b) Access

Foster and Freed, "Child's Right to Visit Grandparents" 506
Milne v. Milne 511
Lapp v. Dupuis 512

X ADOPTION

1. Access after Adoption

Silk v. Silk 519